

AGENDA

**RTD Accountability Committee
Operations Subcommittee
Wednesday, February 3, 2021
3:00- 4:00 p.m.
VIDEO/WEB CONFERENCE
Denver, CO**

1. Call to Order
2. Introductions
3. January 20, 2021 Meeting Summary
(Attachment A)

DISCUSSION ITEMS

4. Equity in Procurement
(Attachment B) Kristyn Trustman, RTD Accountability Committee Member
5. State Audit Recommendations on Operator Retention and Farebox Recovery Ratio
(Attachment C) Jenny Paige, Audit Manager, Office of the State Auditor
6. Brief Discussion on Formulating Recommendations
(Attachment D) Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

7. Follow up from January 20 meeting: Fare Collection Costs for Other Transit Agencies
(Attachment E)
8. Draft Operations Subcommittee Goals
(Attachment F)
9. Next Steps
10. Member Comment/Other Matters
11. Adjournment

ATTACH A

MEETING SUMMARY
RTD ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE
Operations Subcommittee
Wednesday, January 20, 2021
Note: Meeting held virtually via GoToMeeting

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Deya Zavala (Chair)
Krystin Trustman
Crystal Murillo
Elise Jones

Chris Frampton
Rutt Bridges
Troy Whitmore
Lynn Guissing

Others Present: Debra Johnson, Jesse Carter, Doug MacLeod, Brian Welch, Douglas Howey, Jordan Sanchez, Kent Moorman, Bill Sirois, Jyotsna Vishwakarma Nicole Carey, Michael Ford, Barbara McManus, Monika Treipl-Harnke, Alex Hyde-Wright, Mac Callison, Natalie Shishido, Luke Palmisano, Jaime Lewis, Justin Begley, and DRCOG staff.

Call to Order

Deya Zavala, Operations Subcommittee Chair, called the meeting to order at 3p.m.

Meeting Summary from January 6, 2021

No comments.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

RTD briefing on Administrative Costs of Fare Collection

Doug McLeod briefed the subcommittee on the costs of fare collection in 2020 and 2019. This information will be sent to the Committee. Elise Jones asked how this information compares to other agencies. DRCOG staff will research this and provide any findings to the subcommittee (please see materials in February 3rd meeting packet). Chair Zavala asked if any additional information could be given on the costs for fare collection for pass programs. Mr. McLeod did not have any additional information on the costs but said that RTD contracts with Denver Human Services for intake on the LiVE program and contract with a private company for assistance on collecting fares from the electronic passes. Chair Zavala also asked about how dwell times at stops add to the costs of providing services. Mr. McLeod said that RTD did not have sufficient information to answer the question. Ms. Jones asked if dwell time is captured. Mr. McLeod said there is insufficient information and too many variables to accurately capture that information.

Disability Community Perspective on RTD Fixed Route Service Delivery

Jamie Lewis from Colorado Cross Disability Coalition highlighted some of the top issues impacting fixed route service delivery. These issues were provided as a document to the Subcommittee. Crystal Murillo asked what xeriscape means in the context of Mr. Lewis's comments. Mr. Lewis stated that in the context of this presentation it means level boarding for all light rail cars instead of just designated cars as currently is the practice. Ms. Murillo also expressed concern for accessibility at bus stops. Mr. Lewis agreed. Krystin Trustman expressed support for building sidewalks with additional property taxes as is the case in the City of Englewood. Mr. Lewis agreed that example should be further explored. Ms. Jones stated that she believes all recommendations on the Colorado Cross Disability Coalition made would also benefit the general public. Mr. Lewis agreed and said that is why they work with walking and biking advocacy groups. Lynn Guissing asked if Mr. Lewis is recommending that RTD designate space for final mile transportation. Mr. Lewis said yes.

Business Perspective on RTD Fixed Route Service Delivery

Carl Meese from the Auraria Higher Education Center briefed the subcommittee on RTD services that connect near or to the campus staff. This included the campus pass program. He stated that dialogue with RTD staff recently began to discuss this topic further. Ms. Murillo asked if the subcommittee will hear from other campuses. Chair Zavala said there could be opportunity to hear from other campuses. Chair Zavala asked how the campus being commuter-oriented impacts transportation and mobility. Mr. Meese said that students come from the entire RTD region but many access the campus from Colfax. He also said that faculty and staff typically do the same. Chair Zavala asked for an update to the campus program participation. Mr. Meese said that it is currently prorated and allows participants to opt in during the pandemic. Debra Johnson stated that RTD was encouraged by the dialogue between RTD and the Auraria Higher Education Center on the changes to the pass program. Mr. Meese ended the conversation by stating that it is their goal to promote transportation options other than the single occupancy vehicle but a challenge is students, faculty, and staff who have commutes that have multiple stops.

Next Steps

The next meeting will take place on February 3, 2021. Chair Zavala asked the subcommittee if they would like to hear from other campuses in meetings outside of the regularly scheduled ones. There was consensus to do that.

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

Member Comment/Other Matters

Elise Jones asked subcommittee members to remember to bring discussions to the meetings so that they can be public and transparent. Ms. Jones also asked about the future meeting topics. DRCOG staff stated that a draft table will be provided at the next meeting.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at about 4pm.

ATTACH B

To: Members of the RTD Accountability Committee Operations Subcommittee

From: Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner
(303) 480-6731 or mhelfant@drcog.org

Meeting Date	Agenda Category	Agenda Item #
February 3, 2021	Discussion	4

SUBJECT

Equity in Procurement

PROPOSED ACTION/RECOMMENDATIONS

N/A

ACTION BY OTHERS

N/A

SUMMARY

At the January 20th meeting, the Subcommittee started discussing service delivery. At the February 3rd meeting this topic will continue with the role procurement of vehicles plays in service delivery. RTD Accountability Committee member Krystin Trustman will provide her perspective on this topic as a regular RTD rider and a member of RTD's Access-a-Ride Paratransit Advisory Committee.

PREVIOUS DISCUSSIONS/ACTIONS

N/A

PROPOSED MOTION

N/A

ATTACHMENT

N/A

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

If you need additional information, please contact Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner, at 303-480-6731 or mhelfant@drcog.org.

ATTACH C

To: Members of the RTD Accountability Committee Operations Subcommittee

From: Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner
(303) 480-6731 or mhelfant@drcog.org

Meeting Date	Agenda Category	Agenda Item #
February 3, 2021	Discussion	5

SUBJECT

State Audit Recommendations on Operator Turnover

PROPOSED ACTION/RECOMMENDATIONS

N/A

ACTION BY OTHERS

N/A

SUMMARY

Prior to the Covid-19 pandemic, significant bus and train operator turnover forced regular delays and cancelations. On December 21st, the latest performance audit of RTD was published and presented (Attachment 1) to the Legislative Audit Committee. The audit contains recommendations on improvements that can be made to try to reduce operator turnover. Jenny Paige from the Office of State Auditor will provide an overview of the recommendations.

PREVIOUS DISCUSSIONS/ACTIONS

N/A

PROPOSED MOTION

N/A

ATTACHMENT

Link: [Colorado Office of the State Auditor RTD Performance Audit December 2021](#)

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

If you need additional information, please contact Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner, at 303-480-6731 or mhelfant@drcog.org or Jenny Paige, Audit Manager, Office of the State Auditor at jenny.page@state.co.us.

ATTACH D

To: Members of the RTD Accountability Committee Operations Subcommittee

From: Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner
(303) 480-6731 or mhelfant@drcog.org

Meeting Date	Agenda Category	Agenda Item #
February 3, 2021	Discussion	6

SUBJECT

Brief Discussion on Formulating Recommendations

PROPOSED ACTION/RECOMMENDATIONS

N/A

ACTION BY OTHERS

N/A

SUMMARY

The Subcommittee Chair has decided to dedicate time at the end of each meeting to discuss formulating recommendations based on topics the subcommittee has already discussed. So far, the subcommittee has discussed or began discussions on service planning, fare structure and pass programs, and service delivery.

PREVIOUS DISCUSSIONS/ACTIONS

N/A

PROPOSED MOTION

N/A

ATTACHMENT

N/A

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

If you need additional information, please contact Matthew Helfant, Senior Transportation Planner, at 303-480-6731 or mhelfant@drcog.org.

ATTACHE

Fare Collection Costs

RTD's costs associated with fare collection consist of treasury management and revenue equipment group costs. In 2019, fare collection costs made up 3.3% (\$5,031,800) of total fare revenue and 5.7% (\$4,503,327) in 2020 due to decreased fare revenue.

Factors that affect fare collection efficiency include the size and modal composition of the transit agency and system equipment procurement and updating.¹ Factors that may decrease fare collection costs include fixed-calendar monthly passes, rolling passes (or rechargeable passes), and eliminating local zones.²

It is typical for transit agencies to spend 5-15% of fare revenue on fare collection. Fare collections costs with smart card-based fare systems start at levels of around 15% (or \$0.15 on the dollar) and reduce these levels to as low as 6% of fare revenue, contingent on the size of the agency, asset deployment strategies, operational strategies and labor contracts.³ Costs of fare collection for Bus Rapid Transit systems typically range from 7-12% of operating costs.⁴

The fare technology company, Masabi conducted a 2019 survey of primarily North American transit agencies, which showed that about 33% of agencies' core Automatic Fare Collection systems cost under 10% of their fare revenue to run.⁵

Based on these reports, RTD's fare collection costs seem to fall within, if not below the expected range.

¹[National Center for Transit Research. Regional Fare Policy and Fare Allocation, Innovations in Fare Equipment and Data Collection. \(2010\).](#)

²[TCRP. Fare Policies, Structures and Technologies: Update. \(2003\).](#)

³[Smart Card Alliance. Planning for New Fare Payment and Collection Systems: Cost Considerations and Procurement Guidelines. \(2010\)](#)

⁴[ITDP. BRT Planning Guide, 4th Edition. Volume 5 Technology, 18.7 Costs.](#)

⁵[Masabi. Transit Agency Research Report: The State of Fare Collection. \(2019\).](#)

ATTACH F

Operations Subcommittee

1. Assess and make recommendations on how **RTD fares and pass programs** can be improved to increase equity, ridership, affordability and ease of access.
 - Make eco passes available to riders outside of their employment
 - Consider an expansion of mobile ticketing
 - Consider allowing for rear loading of buses
2. Make recommendations on how **RTD can enhance service delivery to transit-reliant**, vulnerable populations (i.e., older adults, communities of color, people with disabilities, low income, zero car households) through different models of service delivery (e.g., contracting out to local providers, use of Lyft/Uber/TNCs, vanpool support, etc.) and reflecting changing travel trends post-COVID-19.
 - Consider changes in service provision that focuses on higher density areas rather than entire eight county area
 - Look at first and last mile deficiencies
3. Focus on **proactive, community-based transit service planning and operations** (e.g., work with locals to develop options for service changes, integrate transit routes and stop/stations with local land use plans, seek out partnership opportunities, etc.). Strengthen and formalize coordination between RTD and cities and counties with development review review/approval of projects and design of transit service for key developments.
 - Initial step: Information presented
 - Next step: recommendation
4. Undertake an **overall organizational assessment** (human resources, work culture, management and governance of the District; organizational and Board structure).
5. Emphasize social/environmental justice and equity analysis to influence transit services provided, and how needed changes are determined.

Suggested Area of Focus	Suggested Discussion topics	Cmte Mtgs	Recommendation Timeline
Fares/Pass Structure (simplified)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Align all discount fares (seniors, youth, persons with disabilities, and low income) - Create a simple fare and pass structure for customers and operators - Minimize cost burden to equity populations - Deliver communications through easy to access channels & easy to use tools 	1/6/21- Fares & Passes	<p>Jan 7-22nd – Fares recommendation developed & shared with committee for feedback via email</p> <p>Feb. 1 – Coordinate/present to finance cmte</p>
Improve and promote operational & organizational efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ensure equitable distribution of service via equity population access within 15-20 min - Community based transit planning - Worker shortage & implications 	<p>1/20 - Service delivery</p> <p>2/3 –Equity in procurement & State Audit Findings (operator retention)</p> <p>2/17/21 – State Audit findings, staff implications & culture service delivery</p>	<p>Feb. 8-26 Procurement Recommendation developed</p> <p>Mar. 1 -19 – Service delivery rec developed</p> <p>Mar 22 – 30th Workforce rec developed</p>
ADA Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Explore strategies to make fares more affordable for paratransit clients - Find ways to improve client experience- reduce trip durations, make booking easier and more flexible, investigate other needs for clients and possible strategies to address them 	3/3/21- Access-a-ride	
Ensure regional and sub-regional coordination	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support suburban communities with eTOD - Align % of affordable housing + frequent routes - Partnership to optimize bus priority lanes 	3/17 – BRT/Priority lanes, dedicated right of way, & land use near transit (focus: affordable housing)	

		3/31 Asset mgmt., maintenance &	
Formalize Recommendation		April - May	